Ministry of Civil Defence
& Emergency Management
Te Rākau Whakamarumaru

Level 9, 22 The Terrace | PO Box 5010 | Wellington 6145 | NEW ZEALAND
Tel: +64 4 473 7363 | Fax: +64 4 473 7369 | emergency.management@dia.govt.nz | www.civildefence.govt.nz

Decision on CDEM Resilience Fund applications for 2012/13

To: Coordinating Executive Group Chairs

Summary

The evaluation of the applications of funding for the 2012/13 round of the CDEM Resilience Fund has been completed. The External Evaluation Panel provided recommendations on projects for approval, conditional approval, and decline. I have made the final decision on the outcome of the applications and we will now work to finalise the arrangements for those projects going ahead.

Process

A total of 30 applications were received from CDEM Groups and local authorities for the funding of projects to commence in the 2012/13 financial year[1]. These applications sought funding of over $1.4 million for the 2012/13 and subsequent financial years.

The members of the External Evaluation Panel were:

- Frances Sullivan (LGNZ)
- Pat Dougherty (Kapiti Coast District Council, Wellington CDEM Group CEG Chair)
- Roger Fairclough
- Wendy Everingham (Project Lyttelton)
- Jason Leppens (TPK).

The External Panel meet to consider the assessments on 10 April 2012. 28 of the proposals were discussed and scored by the Panel at that meeting. The Panel agreed on the recommendations to the Director on the proposals to be approved, subject to some conditional approval, or declined. The recommendations were provided to the Director on 27 April 2012.

Overall findings of the External Panel

The Panel noted that overall, not a lot of the proposals received were especially strategic in nature and many didn't meet the criteria of the Fund as they were judged to be addressing areas of work that fall within local authority responsibilities (hazard studies) or were for general operating and business as usual activities for local authorities (lifelines engagement and planning public education, alternate EOC development).

The Panel noted that the quality of the application submissions was variable. Some applications were clearly explained and argued; others presented insufficient information to enable a clear assessment of the proposal. However, there were some proposals that were

[1] Two of these applications were received late and were not able to be assessed by the Panel.

clear and well-presented and would have significant wider benefit to the sector once completed.

Director's decision on proposals

On the basis of the External Panel's recommendations, I have reached a final decision on the outcome of the applications. The list of approved and declined proposals is outlined in the attached table.

12 proposals have been declined. These were judged to be addressing areas of work that fall within local authority responsibilities (hazard studies) or are general operating and business as usual activities for local authorities (lifelines engagement and planning public education, alternate EOC development) and therefore were not within the established criteria for the fund.

18 proposals have been approved.

The list of approved, conditionally approved and declined projects is outlined in the attached table. The table includes the score provided the Evaluation Committee, the amount of funding approved along with some comments of the Panel.

MCDEM website project

Following the allocation of Resilience Funding to approved and conditionally approved projects, there is a surplus of $150,000. I have decided to use these funds to help support the redevelopment of the MCDEM website to update the functionality of the website and to enable it to be improved to share resources and information across CDEM Groups and local authorities. In this way, the project supports the intent of the Resilience Fund and will provide benefits across the CDEM sector.

Next steps

The commencement of approved projects can only begin once a letter of agreement has been signed by the chief executive of the lead local authority and the Director. We will be sending out letter of agreements to those approved projects in the next week.

All letters of agreement will stipulate the conditions associated with the reimbursement of costs by the resilience fund. These will include the reporting requirements, conditions on expenditure, and milestones for completion.

Any further questions of queries regarding the process and the outcome should be communicated to Alan Walker, Manager Development (email: alan.walker@dia.govt.nz) or Sara Leighton, Senior Advisor Planning and Business Support (email: sara.leighton@dia.govt.nz). There is, however, no review process for the applications – the decisions reached on applications declined is final.

John Hamilton
Director Civil Defence Emergency Management

Evaluation of CDEM Resilience Fund applications for 2012/13

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
1	The effectiveness of compost toilets in an emergency	Wellington CDEM Group	70	Yes	$ 23,000	The Panel considered that there would be some value for the sector in this project, but that perhaps a collation of existing information would be more valuable than a trial. However, looking at alternative options to Port-a-loos and chemical toilets was considered a good idea.
2	Emergency water tanks for the home	Wellington CDEM Group	44	No	0	The Panel considered that although home water storage is a good idea, this is a project that doesn't have wide applications outside of the region. A smaller trial number may have been more favourable.
3	Managing residual flood risk on the Waikanae River	Wellington CDEM Group	59	Yes	$ 50,000	More specific mapping, looking at degree and location of inundation.
4	EMIS Implementation	Bay of Plenty Emergency Management Office	62	Yes	$ 100,000	Agreed – but opportunity to look at alignment of EMIS training bids – especially with the Waikato and Hawke's Bay Groups.
5	Equipping welfare response trailer	Rotorua District Council	40	No	0	Business as usual activity. Suggested that should be funded by local community. Not very strategic.

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
6	Tsunami Warning System	Opotiki District Council	71	Yes	$ 17,500	Small council.
7	EMIS Trainer/Public Educator	Joint (Nelson-Tasman, Marlborough, West Coast)	65	Yes	$ 55,000	Appreciated joined up application. Can only approve for one year (annual appropriation). Suggestion that EMIS training should be provided in an aligned way – particularly with the Otago/Southland bid (consolidation of bids for assistance). Funding for public education role part of bid declined as considered a business as usual activity. Noted that had been requested for over 3 years, but funding approved only for 1st year.
8	Fuel Resilience	West Coast Regional Council	76	Yes	$ 19,258	Small council
9	EMIS initial data entry	Waikato Group Emergency Management Office	50	Yes	$40,000	Largely a BAU activity but noted critical nature of this work across 11 councils. Noted may have more applications along these lines in future as training on system completed.
10	Geological hazard review	Gisborne District Council	47	No	0	BAU activity, although some sympathy as small council with large area to assess. Considered that work may be better linked with a GNS proposal for the development of a liquefaction decision making tool.

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
11	Northland Resilience Project – community, tourism and business	Northland Regional Council	78	Yes	$ 60,000	One of top 5 rated projects. Good proposal (although exceeded word limit!).
12	Northland Lifelines Group support for projects 2012	Northland Regional Council	54	No	0	Confusing proposal. No external dissemination. BAU.
13	Community signage	Northland Regional Council	66	Yes	$ 30,000	Beneficial project to complete tsunami signage for a high risk area.
14	Chatham islands tsunami inundation modelling and signage	Chatham Island Council	66	Yes	$70,000	Project being modified to look at satellite imagery as a cheaper option for achieving similar results. Seeking too high a level of precision on information sought.
15	Tsunami signage and advertising	Southland District Council	57	Yes	$ 20,000	Completion of tsunami signage in a risk prone area; part of a comprehensive programme.
16	EMIS – development and training	Southland District Council	68	Yes	$ 40,000	EMIS is critical to CDEM, but suggest alignment opportunities for training should be investigated – particularly with the Nelson/Marlborough/West Coast bid.
17	Wairoa civil defence radio telephone system	Wairoa District Council	60	Yes	$ 58,486	Not a lot of alignment outside of Group Plan, although does fill a capability gap but with no wider sector benefits. No other options considered – what about satellite/internet options?

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
18	Implementation of EMIS	Hawke's Bay Regional Council	73	Yes	$ 21,800	EMIS is critical to CDEM, but suggest that alignment opportunities are investigated with Waikato and Bay of Plenty bids, view that training should be provided on "national" basis.
19	Incorporating lifelines in Group CDEM and Recovery Plans	Hawke's Bay Regional Council	74	No	0	Discounted as considered BAU activity; Lifelines activity was allowed to lapse in Hawkes Bay.
20	New Zealand ShakeOut	Horizons Regional Council	50	No	0	BAU activity. $ per hour seems excessive.
21	OP Arena	Palmerston North City Council	67	No	0	Discounted as considered BAU activity.
22	Whanau resilience project	Taranaki Regional Council	81	Yes	$ 23,000	Highest-equal rated project. Potential for greater national benefits. Aligns well with goals and objectives. Supports vulnerable communities.
23	Marae emergency welfare response plan	Taranaki Regional Council	81	Yes	$ 22,000	Highest-equal rated project. Potential for greater nationwide benefits. Also TPK$ involved. Marae are traditional welfare/accommodation posts, but not included in official response planning. Could be developed more for wider audience to provide national template; won't work in all situations but would be a good start.

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
24	Enhancing alerting platform to nationwide coverage	Auckland Council	78	No	0	Questions around MCDEM's role and should this be done nationally and as a national-level trial? Also questions around proposed procurement process.
25	Porting alerting platform iPhone app to other smartphone platforms	Auckland Council	78	No	0	Questions around MCDEM's role and should this be done nationally and as a national-level trial? Also questions around proposed procurement process.
26	National public education video resources	Auckland Council	55	No	0	Question whether a gap in this area actually exists and about alignment with national level programmes.
27	Canterbury Resiliency Strategy	Canterbury Regional Emergency Management Office	55	No	0	Should be greater encouragement of community response planning and implementation of current plans/strategies. This is BAU activity. Project not well described.
28	Regional tsunami early alert system trial	Canterbury Regional Emergency Management Office	57	No	0	Not considered an effective solution. Low local-source tsunami threat to this coastline.

Number	Title	Local authority	Score (total 100)	Approval	Amount approved	Comment of Evaluation Committee
29	Integrated Community Recovery – a framework for action.	Waimakariri District Council	Not scored	Yes	$40,000	A late application - not scored by panel, but considered meritorious in light of the successful programme after the Canterbury earthquakes. Deemed to be important to capture the essential elements of the programme, to be available to other communities to consider.
30	Community-led experiences in resilience following the Canterbury earthquakes.	Project Lyttelton	Not scored	Yes	$30,000	A late application – not scored by panel. Seen as an opportunity to capture the essential elements of community initiatives in resilience following the Canterbury earthquakes – Aranui, Sumner and Lyttelton, to be available for other communities.
31	Upgrading MCDEM website to allow automatic entry of local emergency information into national website.	MCDEM	Not scored	n/a	$150,000	Not an application. Opportunity arose after bids closed to upgrade MCDEM website to allow automatic transferring of local information to the national website. Considered to be of strategic significance to all of CDEM sector and local communities.
Total amount approved					**$870,044.00**	**[Total funding available $869,565]**